

Reply to comment by V N Zharkov “On estimating the molecular viscosity of the Earth’s outer core”

D E Smylie, V V Brazhkin, A Palmer

DOI: 10.3367/UFNe.0179.200901f.0108

Our paper, “Direct observations of the viscosity of Earth’s outer core and extrapolation of measurements of the viscosity of liquid iron”, (*Usp. Fiz. Nauk* 179 91 (2009) [*Phys. Usp.* 52 93 (2009)]) used gravimetry and nutation observation data to estimate the viscosity of Earth’s outer core. While these estimates are surely open to critical analysis and discussion (as is any interpretation of indirect experimental data), we argue that their underlying data are consistent with the current understanding of physics of the Earth. The unexpectedly high values of the viscosity of Earth’s core obtained from our data are consistent with earlier empirical estimates available for the viscosity of iron melt at megabar pressures.

In his paper, V N Zharkov does not question the seismic data we relied on in making our estimates and focuses instead on criticizing an Arrhenius type empirical model. In doing so, V N Zharkov uses estimates from his own, equally empirical, models as counterarguments. Without going into their detailed analysis here, note that the well-known vitrification of isothermally compressed molecular liquids clearly demonstrates the limited nature of these models. That hundreds of molecular liquids show a viscosity increase of more than ten orders of magnitude when isothermally compressed by 20–40 vol.% is at odds with V N Zharkov’s formulas (C2) and (C6).

The only thing the comment argues — and this is where we fully agree with the author — is that using empirical models to extrapolate the viscosity of a liquid to a high pressure is a poor approach for achieving a definitive result.

D E Smylie Department of Earth and Space Science and Engineering,
York University,
4700 Keele Street, Toronto, Ontario, M3J 1P3, Canada
Tel. (416) 736 2100, ext. 66438. Fax (416) 736 5817
E-mail: doug@core.yorku.ca

V V Brazhkin L F Vereshchagin Institute for High Pressure Physics,
Russian Academy of Sciences,
142190 Troitsk, Moscow region, Russian Federation
Tel. (7-495) 751 00 11. Fax (7-495) 751 00 12
E-mail: brazhkin@hppi.troitsk.ru

A Palmer Sander Geophysics Ltd., 260 Hunt Club Road, Ottawa,
Ontario, K2P 1K2, Canada
E-mail: palmer@core.yorku.ca

Received 4 August 2008

Uspekhi Fizicheskikh Nauk 179 (1) 108 (2009)

DOI: 10.3367/UFNr.0179.200901f.0108

Translated by E G Strel’chenko; edited by A Radzig
